## MINUTES OF PUBLIC HEARING ON OCTOBER 13, 2010 AND OCTOBER 22, 2010

## BROOME COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (STELLAR 83 COURT LLC Project)

- 1. Joseph B. Meagher, Esq., Counsel to the Broome County Industrial Development Agency (the "Agency"), called the public hearing to order at 12:10 p.m. on October 13, 2010. The meeting was, thereafter, adjourned to October 22, 2010 wherein Mr. Meagher called the public hearing to order at 11:37 a.m.
- 2. A stenographic transcript of the public hearing held on October 13, 2010 is attached hereto as Exhibit "A".
- 3. A stenographic transcript of the public hearing held on October 22, 2010 is attached hereto as Exhibit "B".

BROOME COUNTY INDUSTRIAL

DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

By:

Dated: December 8, 2010

Joseph B. Meagher, Counsel

**EXHIBIT "A"** 

	1
1	STATE OF NEW YORK
2	
3	RE: STELLAR 83 COURT, LLC
4	
5	
6	PUBLIC HEARING
7	
8	HELD ON: October 13, 2010
9	HELD AT: Broome County Library
10	
11	BEFORE: HON. JOSEPH MEAGHER
12	Hearing Officer
13	
14	APPEARANCES:
15	RICHARD D'ATTILIO,
16	Executive Director of IDA
17	CHERYL INSINGA, ESQ.
18	Attorney for Binghamton School District
19	STEVEN GLADSTONE,
20	Principal of Stellar 83 Court, LLC
21	EUGINE BURNS,
22	IDA Member
23	REPORTED BY: NICOLE M. ROCKWELL
24	Court Reporter

## VERBATIM REPORTING & VIDEO 1800-368-3302

21

22

23

24

HEARING OFFICER: Good afternoon, let the record reflect that it is now 12:10. My name is Joseph Meagher and I'm counsel to the Broome County Industrial Development Agency. The agency is conducting a hearing today pursuant to General Municipal Law 859-a to seek public comment on an application for financial assistance submitted by Stellar 83 Court LLC, in connection with a proposed student housing and commercial space project to be located at the Midtown Mall, 15-17 Chenango Street and 83-87 Court Street in the City of Binghamton. The acceptance of the filing by the agency does not infer any position on the approval or disapproval of the financial assistance requested. No position will be taken by the agency until the public hearing is concluded.

A copy of the application, along

22

23

24

with the cost-benefit analysis, prepared by the agency is available for your review. Notice of this hearing was published in the Press & Sun Bulletin on September 12, 2010. I would ask that the affidavit of publication be spread upon the record of these proceedings. request that each person wishing to speak state his or her name and if you're speaking on behalf of an entity or organization, please identify that entity or organization. The hearing will remain open until all public comment has concluded.

At the outset I'm going to ask Richard D'Attilio, executive director of the agency, to explain the tax benefits and financial assistance that has been requested by the applicant, Stellar 83 Court LLC.

MR. D'ATTILIO: I'll first give

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

23

24

you just a very brief overview of the project itself, as proposed in the agency's application for assistance. This is a redevelopment of properties on Court and Chenango Street, a sum of 124,000 square feet approximately. It is a rehabilitation of a vacant building, that has stood vacant now for almost 30 years. It's a combination building that has frontage on Court and Chenango Street. redevelopment calls for first floor and possible second floor commercial space and the balance of the space would be developed for student housing in the rest of the building. The estimated total project cost investment, land, building and renovation, along with other engineering costs, is approximately 10 billion dollars.

This is a deviation from the agency's standard payment lieu of

tax schedule and as a result of that
it does require that the city
advance a request in sponsorship for
the deviation. The deviation has
been presented at a work session, it
is now pending final review and
approval by city council, to be

acted on on October 20th.

I do have a copy of the schedule here for everybody's review. As proposed, although as I said this is not a final approval by the city as yet. With that if there are questions specifically about the PILOT, I'm here to address them, it is a fairly complicated -- complex formula, but it does result in a significant increase in payments over and above what currently is being paid on the facilities as it sits vacant and in serious disrepair.

PUBLIC: Cheryl Insinga, attorney from Coughlin & Gerhart,

here on behalf of the Binghamton
City School District. I would just
request a copy of the schedule.

PUBLIC: Could you e-mail me a copy of that schedule, I would like it for my file.

HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect that the comment was by Broome County Industrial Development Agency Board Member Eugene Burns.

Do we have any further comments either for or against the project?

(NO VERBAL RESPONSE.)

HEARING OFFICER: I would like the record to reflect the five people that are here. So if we could go through and have everyone state their name again. I'm Joseph Meagher.

MR. D'ATTILIO: I'm Richard D'Attilio, executive director of the Broome County IDA.

PUBLIC: Steven Gladstone, I'm principal of Stellar 83 Court LLC.

PUBLIC: Cheryl Insigna,
Coughlin & Gerhart, Binghamton City
School District.

PUBLIC: I'm Eugene Burns,
Vestal, New York and I'm a member of
the Broome County IDA.

HEARING OFFICER: As the executive director has indicated, the proposed PILOT schedule has been presented to the City of Binghamton at a workshop, but it has not yet been approved by them and the possibility remains open that they might approve a PILOT schedule different than what has already been presented. That being the case, I'm going to request that this hearing be continued until October 22nd, at 11:30 a.m., at the Broome County Public Library in this room.

PUBLIC: You may want to specify it's the exhibit room.

HEARING OFFICER: The exhibit room. This will precede the

agency's October meeting to take place on October 22nd, at 12:00.

Any further comments from anyone?

(NO VERBAL RESPONSE.)

HEARING OFFICER: I now declare this hearing continued until October 22nd.

### CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes taken by me on the above cause and that this is a correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

Acol Meckers

NICOLE M. ROCKWELL

## MIDTOWN MALL ANNUAL PROPOSED PILOT PAYMENT

			levies	4,900,000 Taxes are calculated at this years levies	Taxes are calcula	4,900,000	L1 with 0%	4,900,000 II with 0%	1/1/2023
	\$1,273,946.00	Grand Total							7/1/2022
	\$ 566,927.00	10	\$133,021.00	\$573,998.00	TOTALS				
	\$ 187,112.00	1/1/2023 \$	\$43,905.00	\$189,416.00	51.542	3,073,000	70 MINIA	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	
	\$ 121,110.00	1/1/2022 \$	528,417.00	00.000,221¢	14.00	2 675 000	4 900 000 10 with 75%	4 900 000 1	7/1/2022
		\$ 1202/1/T	\$25,754.00	\$133 COO OO	50 041	2.450.000	9 with 50%	4,900,000 9 with 50%	7/1/2021
			\$13,70,00	\$50 514 00	48 583	1.225.000	8 with 75%	4,900,000 8 with 75%	7/1/2020
			\$5.849.00	\$25,234,00	47.168	535,000	7 with 0%	4,900,000 7 with 0%	7/1/2019
	1		\$5.679.00	\$24,499,00	45.794	535,000	6 with 0%	4,900,000 6 with 0%	7/1/2018
			\$5,513.00	\$23,786.00	44.461	535,000	5 with 0%	4,900,000 5 with 0%	(102/1//
			\$5,353.00	\$23,093.00	43.166	535,000	4 WITH 0%	4,900,000 4 With 0%	0107/1/
		1/1/2016 \$	\$5,196.00	\$22,420.00	41.908	535,000	S WITH U%	4,500,000 S WITH 0%	7/1/2016
	\$ 21,503.00	1/1/2015 \$	\$5,045.00	00.007,17¢	10.000	200,000	3	A 000 000	7/1/2015
		C 5707/1/2	\$1,000.00	634 760 00	40 600	535,000	2 with 0%	4,900,000 2 with 0%	7/1/2014
		1/1/2014	00 868 P\$	\$21,134,00	39.503	535,000	1 with 0%	4,900,000 1 with 0%	//1/2013
		1/1/2013 \$	\$4,755.00	\$20,614.00	38,532	535,000	0%	223,000	2007/1/2
	\$ 19,678.00	1/1/2012 \$	\$4,617.00	\$19,920.00	37.235	22,000	200	E3E 000	7/1/2012
	35.712 x 1.03/y	4	8.35 x 1.03/y	A/SOTTXCE7'/C		F3F 000	00/	900	7/1/2011
The School	The School	City @ County 1	ine County	1	Line and 111	assessment	NA-normal levies	큐	M0./Year
or payments to	rayment to				plus 3%/Vr	Effective	of assessment	Beginning	date
Simplification		1	Payment to	Payment to	City tax rate		Pilot year with %	z years prep	THAI TON
5	Annual	Schedule of	Annual	Annual	Effective		years 1-7 @0%	3	Assessment
								HOLAI LOAD SECTION OF A SECTION	OTOT leade



# MIDTOWN MALL ANNUAL TAX PAYMENTS - PRE-CONSTRUCTION

- 4	×
	ì
1	
۰	
-	
8	ξ
4	ς
-	3
	_
2	9
ì	2
	ì
3	
	i

	TOTAL LIAND LAURE			
Assessment	10 years with	Annual	Annual	Annual
final roll	0 Improvments	Payment to	Payment to	Payment to
date	Beginning	The City	The County	The School
M0./Year	Assessment	37.235x1.06/y	8.35 x 1.06/v	35.712 v 1.06/v
7/1/2011	125,000	\$4,933.62	\$1.106.37	\$4 731 75
7/1/2012	125,000	\$5,229.62	\$1.172.75	\$5,015.75 \$5,015.75
7/1/2013	125,000	\$5,543.37	\$1.243.12	\$5.316.62
7/1/2014	125,000	\$5,875.87	\$1,317.62	\$5,635.62
7/1/2015	125,000	\$6,228.37	\$1,396.75	\$5,973.75
7/1/2016	125,000	\$6,602.12	\$1,480.50	\$6,332.25
7/1/2017	125,000	\$6,998.25	\$1,569.37	\$6,712.12
7/1/2018	125,000	\$7,418.12	\$1,663.50	\$7,114.87
7/1/2019	125,000	\$7,863.12	\$1,763.37	\$7,541.75
7/1/2020	125,000	\$8,335.12	\$1,869.12	\$7,994.25
7/1/2021	125,000	\$8,835.12	\$1,981.25	\$8,474.00
7/1/2022	125,000	\$9,365.12	\$2,002.25	\$8,982.37
	TOTALS	\$83,227.82	\$18,565.97	\$79,825.10
		Unimproved	Grand Total	\$181 618 80

Approximate	Improved PILOT
Difference	Grand Total
\$1,092,327.11	\$181,618.89 \$1,273,946.00

## MidTown Mall Annual Tax Payment Schedule at 100%

Assessment final roll date	Assessment	Annual Payment to the City of Binghamton 37.235 x 1.03/y	Annual Payment to Broome County 8.35 x 1.03/y	Annual Payment to Binghamton School 35.17 x 1.03/y
7/1/2011	535,000	19,920.73	4,467.25	18,815.95
7/1/2012	535,000	20,614.62	4,601.00	19,688.00
7/1/2013	4,900,000	193,564.70	43,414.00	185,759.00
7/1/2014	4,900,000	199,371.20	44,737.00	185,759.00
7/1/2015	4,900,000	205,349.20	46,109.00	191,345.00
7/1/2016	4,900,000	211,513.40	47,530.00	197,127.00
7/1/2017	4,900,000	217,858.90	49,000.00	203,056.00
7/1/2018	4,900,000	224,390.60	50,470.00	209,181.00
7/1/2019	4,900,000	231,123.20	51,989.00	215,453.00
7/1/2020	4,900,000	238,056.70	53,557.00	221,921.00
7/1/2021	4,900,000	245,200.90	55,174.00	228,585.00
7/1/2022	4,900,000	252,555.80	56,840.00	235,445.00
Totals		2,259,519.95	507,888.25	2,112,134.95
			Grand Total	4,879,543.15

**EXHIBIT "B"** 

```
1
   STATE OF NEW YORK
 2
 3
      RE: STELLAR 83 COURT, LLC
 4
 5
 6
               PUBLIC HEARING
 7
   HELD ON: October 22, 2010
 8
 9
   HELD AT: Broome County Library
10
11
     BEFORE: HON. JOSEPH MEAGHER
         Hearing Officer
12
13
14
   APPEARANCES:
15
   RICHARD D'ATTILIO,
16
       Executive Director of IDA
17
   STEVEN GLADSTONE,
18
       Principal of Stellar 83 Court, LLC
19
   EUGENE BURNS,
20
       IDA Member
   REPORTED BY: NICOLE M. ROCKWELL
21
22
                  Court Reporter
23
24
```

24

HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect that it is 11:37 a.m. on October 22, 2010. We're at a continuation of a hearing conducted by Broome County Industrial Development Agency pursuant to Section 859-a of the General Municipal Law, seeking public comment on an application for financial assistance submitted by Stellar 83 Court LLC. The original hearing was conducted on October 15th and continued to today's date and the reason for the continuation was that the City of Binghamton had not yet acted on the proposed PILOT. It is our understanding that they have since taken action and I am going to turn the record over to Richard D'Attilio, executive director of the agency, to explain for the record what had occurred with the City of Binghamton with respect to this project.

the City Council entertained a resolution that was presented that would adopt the PILOT schedule that has been flooded on the record of our initial public hearing. The resolution passed unanimously, seven to zero, to accept the PILOT schedule as written and a letter of recommendation and request for the agency to deviate from its scheduled policy will be forthcoming.

2.0

So that is the action that was related to us so we can reconvene the public hearing and conclude the public hearing today.

HEARING OFFICER: With that having been said, I will now solicit any comments from the public with respect to this project.

(NO VERBAL COMMENTS.)

HEARING OFFICER: Hearing no comments I'm going to bring the public hearing to conclusion at this time. I would like the record to reflect the

presence of Steven Gladstone on behalf
of the project applicant and Eugene
Burns who is a member of the Broome
County Development Industrial Agency
Board, myself and Dick D'Attilio.

## CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes taken by me on the above cause and that this is a correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

Acol Meckerll

NICOLE M. ROCKWELL